

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
LAWRENCE CIRCUIT COURT
DIVISION NO. II
ACTION NO. 97-CI-00264

COPY

EASTERN CRANE, INC.

PLAINTIFF

VS: DISCOVERY DEPOSITION ON BEHALF
OF PLAINTIFF, OF THE WITNESS:

STEVE PORTER

KENTUCKY POWER COMPANY
and MITCH THOMAS

The DISCOVERY DEPOSITION ON BEHALF
OF PLAINTIFF, OF THE WITNESS, STEVE PORTER, was
taken before Anne Lewis, Notary Public, in and for
the State of Kentucky at Large, on August 5, 1999,
at the offices of Hon. Wendell Roberts, 1505
Carter Avenue, Suite 200, Ashland, Kentucky,
commencing at the approximate hour of 1:00 p.m.

Said deposition was taken pursuant
to Notice, to be used for the purpose of evidence
on behalf of the Plaintiff at the trial of the
above-styled action and for any and all purposes
permitted by the Rules of Civil Procedure.

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1008/26/99

APPEARANCES

FOR PLAINTIFF

**HON. MARRS ALLEN MAY
P.O. BOX 1465
PIKEVILLE, KY 41502**

FOR DEFENDANTS

**HON. WENDELL S. ROBERTS
P.O. BOX 70
ASHLAND, KENTUCKY 41105-0070**

**HON. ANTHONY J. SWANECK
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA
COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-2373**

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

**Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)**

I.N.D.E.X.

CAPTION 1

APPEARANCES 2

INDEX 3

WITNESS:

STEVE PORTER

CROSS-EXAMINATION

By Mr. May 4-62

CERTIFICATE 63

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley

(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)

(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 THEREUPON, THE WITNESS, STEVE
2 PORTER, BEING DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED AS FOLLOWS,
3 TO-WIT:
4

5 CROSS-EXAMINATION

6 BY MR. MAY:

7 Q. 1 State your name, please.

8 A. Steve Porter.

9 Q. 2 Where do you live, Mr. Porter?

10 A. I live in Cattletsburg, Kentucky.

11 Q. 3 Mr. Porter, I'm Marrs Allen May,
12 and, of course, I'm going to be asking you some
13 questions here. And when I ask you a question
14 that I don't make clear and you don't understand,
15 please just tell me and I'll try to rephrase it so
16 you can understand it. This will be completely
17 informal. Any time you want to stop and ask your
18 attorney a question, please feel free to do so.
19 Are you a native of this area, Steve?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. 4 Where were you born?

22 A. Well, when I say "native," I've
23 lived in this area since '72, so pretty much all
24 my life.

25 Q. 5 The reason I ask that is for jury

1 selection purposes. Do you have any relatives in
2 Lawrence County, Kentucky?

3 A. Not to my knowledge.

4 Q. 6 Steve, if you would, and you can do
5 it briefly in summary fashion, would you give me
6 your educational background and your work
7 background?

8 A. Well, I went to Boyd County High
9 School, graduated in '81. From there, I proceeded
10 to college. I graduated from the University of
11 Kentucky in 1988 as an electrical engineer. From
12 that point, I had a job with an electrical
13 contractor consultant for one year. November 16th
14 of '89, I went to work for Kentucky Power Company
15 as an engineer.

16 Q. 7 November--

17 A. '89.

18 Q. 8 Now, you say you went to work for
19 AEP as an engineer.

20 MR. ROBERTS: I think he said
21 Kentucky Power.

22 A. Kentucky Power.

23 Q. 9 I'm sorry. Kentucky Power. Okay.
24 I assume it later became or it's a part of AEP?

25 A. It's a part of AEP.

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 Q. 10 When you say you were an engineer
2 from Kentucky Power, would you tell me exactly
3 what your responsibilities and duties were, what
4 you dealt with?

5 A. Basically, it's a wide variety of
6 everything, from supervising men on the job to
7 brief projects, installation of equipment, design
8 equipment--or, not really design, but small--small
9 scale stuff as far as put a pump here or a motor
10 here, that sort of thing. But other than that, I
11 guess--a little bit of different areas. I mean it
12 wasn't all pure engineering, if you will. It was
13 supervision and so forth.

14 Q. 11 Has your position changed from the
15 beginning of your employment in '89 until present?

16 A. Has it changed? Just in title. I
17 mean as far as the ranks of engineer or
18 progression--or promotion.

19 Q. 12 What is your title presently?

20 A. Presently? Plant engineer Two.

21 Q. 13 In 1993, what would it have been?

22 A. In '93, I'm trying to remember here.
23 It was probably at that time called a performance
24 engineer. As they restructured, they renamed, and
25 that's why the names have changed over the--over

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 the years, just from AEP trying to get everybody
2 a consistent name across the system, is what it
3 amounted to.

4 Q. 14 The name changed but no difference
5 in the duties?

6 A. Right. There you go.

7 Q. 15 I note that it's plant engineer
8 Number Two. Does that indicate that there's a
9 plant engineer Number One that would be above you?

10 A. Yes, sir.

11 Q. 16 And who would that be?

12 A. There's two or three of them there
13 at the plant.

14 Q. 17 Would you name those persons for me?

15 A. Let's see. Ken Borders, I believe,
16 is considered a plant One. I'm trying to think.
17 James Burton, I believe, is a plant One. And this
18 is to the best of my knowledge. I'm not sure how
19 the promotions and so forth have been lately. We
20 just went through another title change, so that's
21 why I'm--I'm trying to recall what positions
22 people are in. I know those two are, but I'm not
23 sure of the titles on a couple of the others.

24 Q. 18 In going through this material here,
25 I've noticed the name of James Burton before.

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 Would he have been the engineer that would have
2 been over you in connection with the work that Mr.
3 Lequire's company performed?

4 A. No, sir.

5 Q. 19 Who would it be, then?

6 A. Who would it be? Well, as far as it
7 goes, your ranks of engineer--the lower ranks of
8 engineers do not report to a higher rank engineer,
9 if you will. We have a supervisor who we would
10 directly report to.

11 Q. 20 I don't have right at my hand now,
12 but I am almost sure that I have seen the name of
13 James Burton or his signature upon documents in
14 this material that I've gone through. Can you
15 tell me why, if I am right, that his name would be
16 there?

17 A. I would have no idea on this
18 particular thing here.

19 Q. 21 So he didn't perform or have any
20 connection whatsoever with the work that Mr.
21 Lequire was doing?

22 A. On this particular pond cleaning
23 here, I don't recall him having involvement--

24 Q. 22 Any connection with it. Okay. You
25 were working there, then, at the plant in 1999,

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley

(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)

(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 when Mr. Lequire's company first did some work for
2 the company. Is that right?
3 A. '99?
4 Q. 23 I'm sorry. '90. If I said '99, I
5 apologize. '90.
6 A. I was at the plant, yes, sir.
7 Q. 24 Did you have any connection or
8 supervision whatsoever in regard to the work that
9 Mr. Lequire performed in 1990?
10 A. To the best of my memory, I think
11 there was one instance on the coal yard runoff
12 ponds, possibly. I'd have to look. To the best
13 of my memory--but other than that, that was it.
14 Q. 25 So it would be merely incidental if
15 you did have any connection with any work he did
16 in 1990?
17 A. Well, like I said, it seems like the
18 coal yard runoff ponds was done in December of
19 '90, I believe. If that--I'm not certain. That
20 would have been the only time.
21 Q. 26 Now, would your responsibilities and
22 duties encompass the settling pond areas or the
23 pond areas?
24 MR. ROBERTS: Back in '93?
25 Q. 27 In '93.

1 A. In 1993? At that time I was
2 basically in charge of our fly ash dam project,
3 which utilizes the ash out of the bottom ponds to
4 build the elevation of the fly ash dam. So at
5 that time I would have some relation to these
6 ponds, yes.

7 Q. 28 Now, you're talking about the fly
8 ash dam. Would you tell me what that is?

9 A. A fly ash dam is--when you burn
10 coal, you get two products. You get a bottom ash,
11 which is heavy stuff that falls to the bottom of
12 your boiler, and then you get a fly ash, which is
13 light stuff that gets carried out through the flue
14 gas system. We collect the fly ash and mix it in
15 a slurry and then pump it over--we've got a pond
16 adjacent to the plant over across in front of the
17 plant that we pump this slurry to in a--in a
18 holding pond.

19 Q. 29 Now, I've taken the deposition of
20 Mr. England, and Mr. England has tried to describe
21 the setup of the ponds there to me. And, as I
22 understand it, and you correct me, Mr. Porter, if
23 I've misstated anything, that at the upper end are
24 two ponds; one which is referred to as the north
25 pond and one which is referred to as the south

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 pond. Below those two ponds are two ponds which
2 are referred to as the settling ponds. Then,
3 below these two settling ponds is a pond that is
4 referred to as the recirculating pond. Is that a
5 fair characterization?

6 A. Yes, sir. There are two ponds in
7 the front which are the bottom ash which we refer
8 to as the north and the south, because one is
9 physically north of the other one, and then you
10 have your two middle ponds that are directly
11 connected next to those, which are the settling
12 ponds, which are the settling ponds which are a
13 north and a south, and then a common recirculating
14 pond.

15 Q. 30 And as I drive by on U.S. Highway
16 23, those are the ponds immediately adjacent to
17 the highway there, aren't they?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. 31 And I would assume that the one that
20 is closest to the highway would be the north pond
21 and the one toward--on the river side would be the
22 south pond?

23 A. With respect to the plant, yes.

24 Q. 32 Now, it's further my understanding
25 from Mr. England that the material comes out of

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 the burners, goes to either the north or the south
2 pond where the primarily heavy stuff settles out,
3 that then the lighter stuff is let out into the
4 two settling ponds where, again, there is a
5 settling process, and then the--probably at that
6 point, I guess, mostly just water is run into the
7 recirculating pond where it is collected and then
8 either used again in the plant or taken and
9 disposed of somewhere?

10 A. The front ponds are what we call the
11 bottom ash ponds, is the first ponds that the ash
12 will discharge into, depending on how they have it
13 set up as to whether it dumps in the north pond or
14 the south pond. Hopefully, all your material will
15 settle out in those two ponds. However, some of
16 the fine stuff will migrate with the water into
17 the middle settling ponds, and, like you say, by
18 the time it gets to the recirc pond, we hope it's
19 pure, clear water.

20 Q. 33 Hopefully, it's just water. Now, as
21 I also understand it, that periodically it's
22 necessary to clean those ponds and the system, as
23 I understand it, is--if they want to clean the
24 north pond, they put everything in the south pond
25 and reverse when they want to change, and when

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 they would put everything in the south pond, they
2 would clean out the north pond. Is that right?

3 A. When they switch from one pond to
4 the other, they--they de-water or let the water
5 out to where--this is only in the front two bottom
6 ash--what we call the bottom ash, front two. At
7 that point, the water will drain to where we can
8 get our heavy equipment in to excavate and clean
9 it.

10 Q. 34 And take out the heavy ash that has
11 settled out there. Then, apparently, periodically
12 it's necessary to clean out the two settling ponds
13 and the recirculating ponds.

14 A. In the time period I've been there,
15 this was the first that it had happened, so I--as
16 far as the past and previous stuff, other than
17 records, that would be the only way I'd know.

18 Q. 35 So this was the first occasion you
19 were ever aware of that they had cleaned out the
20 settling ponds and the recirculating ponds?

21 A. We--we had heard that they sometime
22 previous had done it, but it was a different
23 method, but I had no--like I say, this is the
24 first time I had ever been involved, to my
25 knowledge, as far as it being cleaned.

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 Q. 36 When was the determination made to
2 clean out these settling ponds?

3 A. When was it made? We--the initial
4 contract there or whatever, the quotes, which I
5 believe was in February or somewhere in that time
6 frame.

7 Q. 37 Okay. If it will help you, I note
8 that Mr. Lequire's bid was dated February the 8th,
9 1993. I would assume that, since he quotes a
10 figure of 26,000 cubic yards of fly ash that he
11 proposes to remove, that sometime prior to
12 February the 8th, 1993, some determination was
13 made as to the amount of fly ash that would be
14 needed to remove. Is that true?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. 38 Now, since we have a figure of
17 26,000 cubic yards, I assume that was the figure
18 that was presented to the prospective bidders for
19 the removal of that material?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. 39 Do you know how that 26,000 cubic
22 yard figure was determined?

23 A. Yes. Our AEP lab, our civil lab,
24 came previous to that, and I'm not sure of the
25 exact dates. The dates are somewhere on the

1 papers. But they did a survey to determine how--
2 the level of the ash in the pond from the original
3 drawings of the pond and so forth, they do a--this
4 is all my understanding. They do a--what do you
5 call it--topographic map or whatever, that tells
6 you the elevation change from the original pond
7 structure. He determined that--in two methods--
8 when I say "two methods," two volumes. One was
9 with slope sights, given the natural contour of
10 the pond which gave a figure, I think, of 23
11 something or other, and then he also squared the
12 sides off, given the fact that basically your
13 dredge would be cutting squares. You can't follow
14 contours over the time when--or whatever the
15 contour, so he came up with another figure of like
16 29, and, therefore, we just, for estimation
17 purposes, selected a happy medium of 26.

18 Q. 40 As I understand it, then, you--or
19 they--did you assist them in making these
20 determinations?

21 A. No.

22 Q. 41 As you understood it, what they did,
23 then, was, they took the original drawings of the
24 pond and there must have been some type of
25 elevations on them or something. They took that

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 and they must have, in some way, determined how
2 much material was above the original elevations.
3 How did they do that?

4 A. It's my understanding--like I said,
5 I did not see the original survey. The after
6 survey, when they did it, they performed it using
7 a surveyor's level with a level rod and some kind
8 of ultrasonic device to determine what the bottom
9 elevation physically looks like, as well. But
10 they took rod readings throughout, as well.

11 Q. 42 So they actually measured with a
12 rod?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. 43 Did you observe them doing that?

15 A. Not on the initial, I can't say I
16 did, no.

17 Q. 44 I believe Mr. Thomas, when he
18 testified, stated that, in fact, the device they
19 used was the common ordinary fish finder thing
20 that fishermen use. Is that right?

21 A. Honestly, I wouldn't know.

22 Q. 45 Okay. You don't know what it was,
23 then?

24 A. No, sir.

25 Q. 46 They made, then, two determinations

1 using what would be a slope of the sides of the
2 pond, and then one where they would go directly
3 straight down on the sides of the pond. Is that
4 right?

5 A. Yes, sir.

6 Q. 47 Now, what was the sloped side
7 determination? You told me and I just didn't put
8 it down.

9 A. There should be a paper there. I'm
10 not sure what it was. It was 23--23,000 and
11 something.

12 MR. MAY: I don't believe we have a
13 copy of that paper, Wendell. Do we?

14 MR. ROBERTS: I don't think so. Let
15 me give it to you, then.

16 Q. 48 I'll present you a document that
17 your attorney has just furnished me, and ask you
18 if that was what you were supplied with or saw?

19 A. Yes, they--they gave me this at the
20 time.

21 MR. MAY: May we introduce that as
22 Exhibit One to your deposition.

23 Q. 49 Now, as I understand it, then, you
24 took the average of those two and arrived at the
25 26,000 figure?

1 A. Approximately the average, yes.
2 Q. 50 It's my understanding from both Mr.
3 England and Mr. Thomas that you then or someone
4 contacted three potential construction companies
5 in regard to this removal, one of which was Mr.
6 Lequire's company, one of which was Trans-Ash, and
7 the third one I can't remember. Is that true?
8 A. Yes, sir.
9 Q. 51 Who contacted those companies?
10 A. Myself.
11 Q. 52 How did you do that?
12 A. By telephone.
13 Q. 53 So there was never any written
14 communication with them prior to they submitting
15 bids?
16 A. No, sir.
17 Q. 54 How were these three companies
18 determined as potential bidders?
19 A. Mr. Lequire's company had done other
20 previous work in there for other people in the
21 plant, and they liked his work and so forth, so
22 they wanted him to have the opportunity to bid
23 this. As far as Trans-Ash, they were the company
24 that had the contract on the front two ponds that
25 we clean out regularly for our fly ash dam, so we

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

18

1 thought it fair to let them bid this work as well.
2 The third company, I believe, was--the third
3 company, I believe, was Brand, who did not quote
4 because they didn't have the equipment to do so,
5 and they were primarily just--we try to maintain
6 or get three bids on jobs of this nature or jobs
7 of this size, if you will.

8 Q. 55 Did you then specify the equipment
9 they would need to do this job?

10 A. We told them at that time we wanted
11 to try to do this with a dredge simply for the
12 fact that the fines in the pond were too fine to
13 be--to try to truck without the mess because it
14 would make a--we figured it would make a
15 substantial mess on the roadway.

16 Q. 56 Now, I have a document here, which
17 it's a letter from Mr. Lequire addressed to you.
18 I will ask you if you recognize that document.

19 MR. ROBERTS: Can I look at it?

20 MR. MAY: Sure. I'm sorry.

21 MR. ROBERTS: February 8, '93. Okay.

22 A. Yes, sir.

23 Q. 57 In that document, it sets out a list
24 of equipment that will be provided. Did you
25 examine that?

1 A. Just from what's on this list here.
2 Q. 58 And did you feel that that was
3 capable of performing the work that was to be
4 performed?
5 A. To my knowledge, I know no
6 different. I mean, we take him to be the expert
7 on the equipment.
8 Q. 59 Are you an engineer?
9 A. I'm an electrical engineer; yes,
10 sir.
11 Q. 60 Okay. And did you all approve that
12 bid, then?
13 A. Based on this right here, yes. He
14 was--he was low bidder.
15 Q. 61 Were you the person that was in
16 charge of this project in regard to determining
17 what needed to be done and how it was to be done?
18 A. Primarily, I would say no. There
19 was a Labowie from our AEP headquarters who had
20 the original survey done. They were our ash
21 management people.
22 Q. 62 Would they have determined what
23 equipment was needed, then?
24 A. No.
25 Q. 63 Someone must have determined that

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 because, as I recall, Mr. Thomas testified that
2 one of them was--that they didn't provide the
3 necessary equipment.

4 A. Excuse me?

5 MR. ROBERTS: Objection. I don't
6 recall that.

7 MR. MAY: Okay. Maybe I'm mistaken
8 then.

9 Q. 64 Someone must have made a
10 determination that these people had the necessary
11 equipment.

12 A. "These people" being--?

13 Q. 65 Mr. Lequire.

14 A. Mr. Lequire? When we got our bids,
15 we explained to them that we wanted to move this
16 material with a dredge, and at that point, they
17 were the experts that do this stuff all the time,
18 so it was basically left to their determination to
19 decide if their equipment was good enough. If it
20 was not, he should not have bid.

21 Q. 66 Why would Mr. Lequire have listed
22 the equipment he was going to use if he were not
23 required to have certain specific equipment?

24 MR. ROBERTS: Objection. But go
25 ahead.

1 MR. MAY: Go ahead.

2 MR. ROBERTS: You can go ahead and

3 answer.

4 A. Go ahead? Because as I was stating,

5 this is the first time that we had ever cleaned

6 these ponds utilizing a dredge. To be honest, we

7 did not know what we were up against--I did not

8 know what we were up against. So when we

9 explained this to them that we wanted to clean it

10 by a dredge, we wanted to see basically how they

11 planned on doing it so we can compare apples to

12 apples. You know, it's not fair for one guy to

13 bring in one piece of equipment and another guy

14 not, and their bids be totally off.

15 Q. 67 So you compared, then, and felt that

16 Mr. Lequire's proposal was the best?

17 A. His proposal was the cheapest.

18 Q. 68 But as I recall, you told me that

19 you made a determination that the equipment was

20 adequate.

21 A. I never stated that; no, sir.

22 Q. 69 Okay. I'm sorry. Okay. Let me

23 rephrase it then. In deciding between Mr.

24 Lequire's bid, Trans-Ash's bid, or--and if someone

25 else bid, someone had to make a determination that

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 this equipment was sufficient, didn't they?

2 MR. ROBERTS: Objection. Asked and
3 answered.

4 A. We assumed--like I said before, we
5 assume that they are the expert and know what
6 their equipment's capability is. Otherwise, like
7 I say, that's why we--

8 Q. 70 So if Trans-Ash had said, "We're
9 going to take in a hand pump and a wheel barrow,"
10 you would have assumed they knew what they were
11 doing, and they said, "We can do it for this
12 amount," it wouldn't have made any difference to
13 you?

14 A. Given your example there I think is
15 a little--little--

16 Q. 71 Well, I'm trying to draw a picture
17 there that I hope would point out to you someone
18 had to look at this list of equipment to make some
19 determination as to whether bids were equal.

20 A. As far as the method goes, was what
21 we were interested in was to make sure it was not
22 going to be trucked out to make a mess. From that
23 point, like I said, we leave it up to the experts
24 to decide, you know.

25 Q. 72 So you did not request in your

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 telephone conversation with Mr. Lequire and the
2 Trans-Ash company that they list the proposed
3 equipment, because that made no difference to you?

4 A. I don't recall.

5 Q. 73 You may have done that, mightn't
6 you, Mr. Porter?

7 A. I don't recall. Every bid that he
8 has ever turned in on any job, even outside of
9 this, he's always listed his equipment on it, so
10 I don't recall.

11 Q. 74 Do you recall whether Trans-Ash
12 listed the equipment they were going to use?

13 A. Not right off, I don't.

14 Q. 75 Have you got a copy of their bid
15 still in your records?

16 A. Should have; yes, sir.

17 Q. 76 Let me present a document to you
18 dated February the 4th, 1993 from Trans-Ash and
19 ask you if that's what you received from Trans-
20 Ash.

21 A. Yes, sir.

22 Q. 77 I notice in this it says, "The ash
23 will be discharged into the primary bottom ash
24 ponds." What did they mean by that? Let me see
25 if I can help you. Did that not mean they were

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 talking about pumping it back into the north or
2 south pond?

3 A. Yes, sir. The north or south bottom
4 ash pond.

5 Q. 78 And it says, "Alternatively, a boost
6 pump may be tied into an existing ash line at the
7 bottom ash ponds and the dredge fines discharged
8 directly to the fly ash pond." Were they
9 referring there to an existing pipeline?

10 A. Yes, sir.

11 Q. 79 But the primary plan, then,
12 apparently--or am I mistaken--of Trans-Ash was to
13 pump it back into the north or south pond?

14 A. No, sir. They quoted it both ways,
15 but our choice was, if we put it in the bottom ash
16 ponds up front, we would have to end up trucking
17 it, which we did not want to do, so we wanted to
18 discharge it to the fly ash pond over the hill,
19 which is their alternative method there.

20 Q. 80 Okay. Let me ask you. In your
21 telephone conversations with both Trans-Ash and
22 Mr. Lequire's company, did you tell them that the
23 primary method would be the bottom ash--pumping it
24 into the bottom ash ponds and, alternatively, into
25 the ash line?

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 A. I don't recall. Their bid is dated
2 first. It may have been that we gave them the
3 alternative at first before we got Mr. Lequire's
4 bid.

5 Q. 81 So it may have been, then, that they
6 were acting and responding to the request of
7 Kentucky Power Company when they proposed first to
8 pump it into the north pond and then,
9 alternatively, into an existing line that would
10 take it to the fly ash disposal place?

11 MR. ROBERTS: Objection to the
12 extent--I mean, you can ask him what his
13 understanding of what their intentions were, but
14 as far as knowing their intentions, I don't know
15 if he's in a position to know that. Subject to
16 that, go ahead.

17 MR. MAY: Well, go ahead.

18 A. Will you ask again there?

19 Q. 82 Okay. Let me see if I can rephrase
20 it and make it better. I would assume that Trans-
21 Ash would not have responded in this method unless
22 this had been the methods outlined to them in
23 making their proposal.

24 MR. ROBERTS: Show my objection. Go
25 ahead to the extent that you can--

1 A. I guess you could assume that, since
2 they have both methods here.

3 MR. MAY: Let us introduce that as
4 Exhibit Number Two to the deposition.

5 Q. 83 Now, a determination having been
6 made that Mr. Lequire's bid would be accepted, was
7 there some decision made as to the method Mr.
8 Lequire would do it?

9 A. Would you say that again, please?

10 Q. 84 Okay. Let me see if I can help you
11 and maybe suggest what I'm getting to, because I'm
12 not trying to trap you, Mr. Porter. It is my
13 understanding, for some reason when Mr. Lequire
14 started, it was determined that he would first try
15 to pump it into the existing line--

16 A. Yes, sir.

17 Q. 85 --to dispose of it.

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. 86 Who made that determination?

20 A. It would have been a--probably a
21 collective agreement in the plant there.

22 Q. 87 Now, when we say "a collective
23 agreement," are we talking about yourself, Mr.
24 England, Mr. Thomas and someone else or who?

25 A. At this time, I would--I would be

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 uncertain to say everyone that could potentially
2 be involved there.

3 Q. 88 Okay. In fact, you had your doubts
4 about that, didn't you?

5 A. About?

6 Q. 89 The ability to pump it into this
7 line?

8 A. I wouldn't say that.

9 Q. 90 Well, did you determine that it was
10 impractical to do this?

11 A. No, sir. We--as a matter of fact,
12 the plant, at our own expense, put a tap in the
13 line to do that.

14 Q. 91 But I'm saying that when this was
15 tried, did it not work?

16 A. There was material being moved.

17 Q. 92 But it wasn't working, was it?

18 A. It appeared not to be.

19 Q. 93 And, in fact, you and Mr. Lequire
20 had discussed this and tried to tell the other
21 engineers it wouldn't work and they were being
22 stubborn for a while before they finally conceded
23 it wouldn't work. Isn't that true?

24 A. I won't say all that.

25 Q. 94 Well, then part of that. Okay?

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 Would that be a fair statement, Mr. Porter, that,
2 in fact, you and Mr. Lequire had tried it and
3 discussed it and determined that wouldn't work?

4 A. I think the problem was in the
5 booster pump was not big enough.

6 Q. 95 Okay. But it wasn't working?

7 A. I'd say that would be safe to say.

8 Q. 96 At that point or prior to that, let
9 me ask you if this contributed to the problem in
10 getting it to work. Was there not an occasion
11 where, as I understand it, a valve was left open
12 which allowed some of the heavy material from the
13 north pond to come down into the settling ponds?
14 ? south

15 A. That--there was an occasion when
16 that happened, at which time we put in an extra
17 work order from him to remove those fines, because
18 we were afraid of blocking the line with these
19 fines, yes.

20 Q. 97 So I believe I've got Mr. England
21 and Mr. Thomas to already concede it. It would
22 affect the ability to pump this material out if,
23 in fact, this heavy ash were allowed to come down
24 into the settling ponds, would it not?

25 A. Will you repeat that again?

Q. 98 Okay. Would it not affect the

1 ability to pump out this material in the settling
2 ponds, which was primarily light stuff, if, in
3 fact, some of the heavy material from the north
4 pond was allowed to go into the settling ponds?

5 A. I would not know because I do not
6 know the properties of this dredge. I mean, they
7 use dredges to clean mud out of rivers.

8 Q. 99 Okay. But would it be harder? Now,
9 that's a simple question, Mr. Porter. Would it be
10 harder to move light stuff or heavy stuff?

11 A. Would it be harder to move heavy
12 stuff versus light stuff? I could probably say,
13 yes, it would, but the small amount that was moved
14 or that was there, I don't know how it would
15 affect.

16 Q. 100 Okay. But whatever amount it is, to
17 that extent, it would make it harder?

18 A. Like I said, not knowing the
19 properties of the dredge, I couldn't say that.

20 Q. 101 Any dredge?

21 A. Well, like I said, they--they dredge
22 rivers every day.

23 Q. 102 Okay. But it would make it harder.
24 Now, Mr. Porter, that's a simple question and you
25 know that it would, wouldn't it?

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 MR. ROBERTS: Asked and answered.
2 Q. 103 Would it? You don't know.
3 A. I--I couldn't say for sure, no. I
4 mean, it would make sense, yes, but I--I can't sit
5 here and say yes.
6 Q. 104 I've been handed an interesting
7 document here, Mr. Porter. I want you to look at
8 it and see if you recognize it and see if that's
9 your own document that you produced.
10 MR. ROBERTS: What's the date on it?
11 MR. MAY: March. March work order.
12 A. Yes, sir, I recognize that.
13 Q. 105 Is that your document?
14 A. It is one that I submitted; yes,
15 sir.
16 Q. 106 Now, I want to read from that
17 document. "After Eastern Crane was awarded
18 contract, heavy bottom ash was washed into the
19 contracted ponds. This ash could not be removed
20 by dredge." Did you write that?
21 A. I obviously did; yes, sir.
22 MR. MAY: Let's introduce this as
23 Exhibit Three. Let me introduce the letter from
24 Mr. Lequire, dated February 8th, 1993 as Exhibit
25 Number Four.

1 MR. ROBERTS: Do you mind if we take
2 about two minutes at this point?

3 MR. MAY: Sure.

4 (SHORT RECESS).

5 Q. 107 Mr. Porter, I believe you want to
6 clarify something that you previously stated?

7 A. Yes, sir, I would.

8 Q. 108 Go right ahead.

9 A. On the last article which you gave
10 me, on this extra work authorization, this
11 particular document here is--is typed up in our
12 clerical department. There is a cover letter
13 previous to that which I submitted to have this
14 performed, this--this extra work authorization
15 typed up, which are my words, and if you'll look
16 in the second paragraph, it says, "These heavy
17 fines washed through pose a possible problem of
18 stopping up the line used in the dredging
19 process." I don't recall in here that it would
20 stop up and could not be pumped.

21 Q. 109 So whoever typed that up, then, just
22 typed it up wrong?

23 A. Would have summarized or whatever;
24 yes, sir.

25 Q. 110 And who would that have been?

1 A. Someone in our accounting
2 department.
3 MR. MAY: Let me see that document.
4 Q. 111 And, again, you'll have to excuse me
5 because my copy doesn't have all of it on it, but
6 I notice your name, Steve H. Porter, there. What
7 does that word say beside of it?
8 A. "Initiator."
9 Q. 112 That means that you were the one
10 that--
11 A. I'm the one that prompted it, yes.
12 Q. 113 And I notice "Approval, M.H.
13 Thomas," who is Mitch Thomas. Is that right?
14 A. Yes, sir.
15 Q. 114 Now, let's get back to our pump. In
16 fact, you and Mr. Lequire were working together
17 trying to solve this problem, and Mr. Lequire, in
18 fact, blew up six different pumps trying to pump
19 it through this line, didn't he?
20 A. I could not confirm that; no, sir,
21 I can't.
22 Q. 115 So you don't know whether he blew up
23 any pumps or not?
24 A. I do recall one.
25 Q. 116 You don't know whether there were

1 more than one?

2 A. No, sir.

3 Q. 117 Do you remember going with Mr.

4 Lequire to Mr. England and telling him what was

5 happening, that the pumps were blowing up and you

6 were going to have to look for another method of

7 disposing of this material?

8 A. I recall that conversation, yes.

9 Q. 118 That did happen, didn't it?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. 119 And you joined with Mr. Lequire in

12 saying it wouldn't work, "We're going to have to

13 try something else," didn't you?

14 A. I can't--I'm unsure of that. I

15 recall the problems that we were having at that

16 time.

17 Q. 120 In fact, Mr. Lequire expended quite

18 a bit of money trying to get it to work, didn't

19 he?

20 A. I would have no idea.

21 Q. 121 Was a determination then made that

22 to dispose of the material, a temporary dam would

23 be built up in the north pond dividing it into two

24 sections; the material taken out of the settling

25 pond would be pumped into the upper portion of the

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 north pond behind the dividing dam to segregate
2 the material that was being pumped from the
3 settling ponds into the north pond; the material
4 being pumped from the settlement ponds being
5 placed in the upper portion of the north pond?

6 A. Yes, sir, there was a--there was a
7 dam or a dike built, yes.

8 Q. 122 And the purpose of doing that was to
9 prevent the contamination of the lower portion of
10 the pond with this material that was being pumped
11 out of the settling ponds which was more watery,
12 I guess would be a good word, than the heavy
13 material. Is that right?

14 A. The purpose was to pump the material
15 into this holding area and let the water drain out
16 of it.

17 Q. 123 And there must have been some
18 purpose to have put the dam there or you wouldn't
19 have put a dam there.

20 A. Yes, sir.

21 Q. 124 And what was the purpose?

22 A. To hold these pumpings back to where
23 the water would run out of them, yes.

24 Q. 125 And you didn't want this material to
25 contaminate the whole north pond, did you?

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 A. We did not want it back in there;
2 yes.
3 Q. 126 Let me show you a memorandum which
4 was apparently from you to Mr. Mitch Thomas and
5 ask you if you recognize that.
6 A. Yes, sir.
7 Q. 127 Now, in the last sentence in the
8 first paragraph appears the following: "These
9 fines are being kept separate from the actual
10 bottom ash so it will not contaminate the bottom
11 ash for the dam raising."
12 A. Yes, sir.
13 Q. 128 So, then getting back to the purpose
14 of the dam, that was the purpose of the dam, to
15 prevent this contamination, wasn't it?
16 A. In that sense, yes, we were hoping
17 to keep them separated, as well, but the main
18 purpose--the bottom ash itself is the heavy stuff
19 which we--like I was telling you previously, we
20 raise our fly ash dam with. The fines mixing in
21 with that would contaminate it to a degree, yes.
22 MR. MAY: Let us introduce this as
23 Exhibit Number Five.
24 Q. 129 Now, the dam was built. Mr. Lequire
25 began to move this stuff into this area. In the

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE
Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

36

1 building of the dam there, did you and Mr. Lequire
2 have a discussion as to whether or not there
3 needed to be an overflow pipe?
4 A. I don't recall that.
5 Q. 130 You don't recall Mr. Lequire saying
6 he thought you needed an overflow pipe there?
7 A. To my knowledge, he may have
8 confirmed that with our coal yard who built the
9 dam, but--
10 Q. 131 Did you have any responsibility in
11 the construction of that dam?
12 A. Physically, no.
13 Q. 132 Well, I mean in design?
14 A. No, sir.
15 Q. 133 Who would have been the one that
16 designed the dam?
17 A. I have no idea.
18 Q. 134 You have no idea?
19 A. No, sir. I mean, I believe our coal
20 yard used their--their loaders and dozers to make
21 it, but--
22 Q. 135 Who directed them to make the dam?
23 A. There again, it was probably a joint
24 effort between Mr. Lequire, myself and the coal
25 yard superintendent.

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE
Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 Q. 136 Now, subsequent to the dam being
2 placed there and Mr. Lequire beginning to pump
3 material behind it, did the dam breach or break?
4 A. A small portion did; yes, sir.
5 Q. 137 Tell me about it.
6 A. One corner of the dam gave out.
7 Q. 138 And did that allow this material to
8 come down?
9 A. A small portion of it; yes, sir.
10 Q. 139 As a matter of fact, it let a lot
11 come down, didn't it?
12 A. I would not say a lot.
13 Q. 140 Okay. We've got a picture I'd like
14 for you to look at here. Well, that's okay. Now,
15 so a breach of whatever proportion occurred in the
16 dam, allowing this material to come down into the
17 lower portion of the pond. At that point, did
18 someone open the valve and let this material run
19 back into the settling pond?
20 A. At that time, I don't recall a valve
21 being in the system.
22 Q. 141 You don't recall any of this
23 material washing down into the settling pond?
24 A. Yes, sir, some did.
25 Q. 142 Okay. That's what I'm trying to get

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 at, Mr. Porter. In fact, quite a bit of it washed
2 down into the settling ponds, didn't it?

3 A. I can't say that quite a bit. It
4 was--best of my estimation, at one time when I--
5 basically, after the fact, we gave him an extra
6 work order to remove that where he counted the
7 truckloads and we determined how much.

8 Q. 143 I want to show you a photograph and
9 ask you if that's not a picture of the condition
10 of the north pond after the dam breached or broke.

11 A. I couldn't tell you from this
12 picture, sir. That could be any time, because I
13 don't see the dam or anything in that picture.

14 Q. 144 So you don't know whether this is--

15 A. Not based on that picture, no, sir.

16 Q. 145 Would it normally be that you would
17 see water standing there?

18 A. Only if that pond is in service.

19 Q. 146 But assuming this was the north pond
20 that was in service, would there not have been
21 normally water standing there?

22 A. If that pond was active, meaning we
23 discharge our bottom ash to it, yes, there would
24 be water there.

25 Q. 147 And wasn't the bottom ash being

SISTERS' REPORTING/VIDEOGRAPHY SERVICE

Anne Lewis/Lisa Lewis Conley
(606)789-4790 (Paintsville)
(606)245-1173 (Lexington)

1 discharged into the north pond at that time?
2 A. I could not tell you. I would not--
3 I have no idea to know--no way to know.
4 Q. 148 You mean they used both the north
5 and the south at the same time?
6 A. Not at the same time, no, sir.
7 Q. 149 And it's my understanding from Mr.
8 England and Mr. Thomas's testimony that when you
9 were using one, you would shut the other one down
10 and be cleaning it out.
11 A. Yes, sir.
12 Q. 150 So it couldn't have happened that
13 the north pond and the south pond were being used
14 at the same time?
15 A. No, sir.
16 Q. 151 So--and if the north pond was being
17 used, there should have been water standing there?
18 A. Yes, sir.
19 MR. MAY: Let us introduce this
20 photograph as Exhibit Number Six.
21 Q. 152 So material did go down, then, into
22 the settling ponds which included the heavy ash,
23 didn't it?
24 A. Yes, sir, the best I recall.
25 Q. 153 Now, again, that added to Mr.